

**BEFORE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
INSOLVENCY AND BANKRUPTCY BOARD OF INDIA**

7th Floor, Mayur Bhawan, Shankar Market,
Connaught Circus, New Delhi -110001

Dated: 2nd December 2025

**Order under section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005 (RTI Act) in respect of RTI
Appeal Registration No. ISBBI/A/E/25/000125**

IN THE MATTER OF

Nelson James Macwan

... Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer

The Insolvency and Bankruptcy Board of India

7th Floor, Mayur Bhawan, Shankar Market,

Connaught Circus, New Delhi -110001

... Respondent

-
1. The Appellant has filed the present Appeal dated 2nd November 2025, challenging the communication of the Respondent, filed under the Right to Information Act (RTI Act).
 2. The Appellant had requested for the following information,

"I had sent an email to the Honorable Chairperson, IBBI on 12.06.2025 with the subject line: Urgent Representation: Request for Recognition of PG Valuation Degrees as equivalent to Valuation Examination under the Second Proviso to Rule 5-1. In this regard, I kindly request the following information under the RTI Act, 2005:

(i) Copy of the noting and remarks made by the Chairperson, IBBI on my said email. Copy of the noting and remarks made by any other officer of IBBI on my said email.

(ii) Copy of the reply issued by IBBI to my said email. I am enclosing herewith my email for ready reference.

The CPIO submitted that no information has been provided, as the queries raised in the impugned RTI Application had already been disposed of *vide* emails dated 18th April 2023 and 5th July 2023. Aggrieved by the reply furnished by the CPIO, the Appellant has preferred the present Appeal contending that the response provided is evasive and reflects non-application of mind, which amounts to dereliction of duty under the RTI Act.

3. I have carefully examined the application, the responses of the Respondent and the impugned Appeal. In terms of section 2(f) of the RTI Act 'information' means "*any material in any form, including records, documents, memos e-mails, opinions, advices, press releases, circulars, orders, logbooks, contracts, reports, papers, samples, models, data material held in any electronic form and information relating to any private body which can be accessed by a public authority under any other law for the time being in force.*" It is pertinent to mention here that the Appellant's "right to information" flows from section 3 of the RTI Act and the said right is subject to the provisions of the Act. Section 2(j) of the RTI Act defines the "right to information" in term of *information* accessible under the Act which is held by or is under the control of a public authority. Thus, if the public authority holds any information in the form of data, statistics, abstracts, etc. an applicant can have access to the same under the RTI Act subject to exemptions under section 8.

4. It is pertinent to note that the issues raised in the impugned Appeal have been previously disposed by the First Appellate Authority (FAA) *vide* order dated 9th September 2025. Accordingly, if the Appellant is aggrieved by the order of the FAA, he may avail the appropriate remedies as enshrined under the RTI Act.
5. The Appeal is, accordingly, disposed of.

Sd/-
(Kulwant Singh)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Appellant, Nelson James Macwan
2. CPIO, The Insolvency and Bankruptcy Board of India, 7th Floor, Mayur Bhawan, Shankar Market, Connaught Circus, New Delhi -110001.